Academic Search
Process Overview

Office for Access and Equity

ILLINOIS
Guidance Documents

- Guidelines and Procedures for Academic Appointments
  - [https://oae.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html](https://oae.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html)

- Affirmative Action Regulations
  - [https://oae.illinois.edu/affirmative-action-plan.html](https://oae.illinois.edu/affirmative-action-plan.html)

- Equal Employment Opportunity
  - [https://oae.illinois.edu/discrimination-and-harrassment-prevention.html](https://oae.illinois.edu/discrimination-and-harrassment-prevention.html)

- EEOC Uniform Employee Selection Guidelines
  - [https://www.eeoc.gov/policy/docs/qanda_clarify_procedures.html](https://www.eeoc.gov/policy/docs/qanda_clarify_procedures.html)

- Internet Applicant Recordkeeping Rule
  - [https://www.dol.gov/ofccp/regs/compliance/faqs/iappfaqs.htm](https://www.dol.gov/ofccp/regs/compliance/faqs/iappfaqs.htm)
Academic Search Process

The Academic Search Process is integral to Illinois’ commitment to:

- Affirmative Action
- Diversity
- Equal Employment Opportunity
Difference Between Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) and Affirmative Action (AA)

- **EEO**
  - Prohibits discrimination based on any prohibited characteristic.

- **AA**
  - Requires additional proactive measures to ensure equal employment opportunity; this requires good faith efforts to recruit women, minorities, veterans and individuals with disabilities.
Diversity at Illinois

• Minorities, women, veterans and individuals with disabilities are underrepresented in positions on campus. To review the underrepresentation for the different areas of employment groups, visit: https://oae.illinois.edu/reports.html.

• Addressing underrepresentation requires aggressive college and department efforts involving deans, department heads, equal employment opportunity officers, diversity advocates, search chairs and search committee members.

• Make sure you are aware of the different roles and duties at: https://oae.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html.
Illinois’ Affirmative Action Plan (AAP) accomplishes two objectives:

• Demonstrates the University’s compliance with its affirmative action requirements.

• Meets the University’s objective for increasing diversity and inclusivity.
Why does diversity matter?

• “…June [2014, will be] the completion of what is likely to be the last school year ever which a majority of America’s K-12 public-school students are white.”…

• “…as our society diversifies, broadening the circle of opportunity has become a matter not only of equity but also of competitiveness.”…

• Today’s minority young people are the nation’s future workers, consumers, and taxpayers. If more of them don’t obtain the education and training to reach the middle class, the U.S. “will be a poorer and less competitive society.” (Rice University sociologist Steven Murdock, former Census Bureau director under George W. Bush)

http://www.nationaljournal.com/political-connections/how-we-re-still-failing-60-years-after-brown-v-board-of-education-20140424
Why does diversity matter?

• A large and growing body of research provides evidence that a diverse student body, faculty, and staff benefits our teaching and research mission by increasing creativity, innovation, and problem-solving

• Diverse working groups more productive, creative, and innovative (e.g., Herring, 2009)

• Ideas generated by diverse groups of higher quality (McLeod et al., 1996)

• Level of critical analysis of decisions and alternatives higher in groups exposed to minority viewpoints (e.g., Sommers et al., 2006; Antonio et al., 2004)
Office for Access and Equity (OAE) Role

- Oversight of the Academic Search Process
- Affirmative Action compliance for the University
- EEO area investigates complaints of discrimination and harassment
- ADA area facilitates reasonable accommodations
- Training and Education
Equal Employment Opportunity Officer Role

- College/Unit oversight for:
  - Affirmative Action
  - Equal Employment Opportunity
  - Fair and consistent processes, procedures and practices across all departments
Diversity Advocate Role

- Help guide the search committee to make certain that the search process:
  - Is free of bias or stereotyping of applicants in verbal or written communication
  - Ensures that candidates are evaluated fairly
  - Includes a campus visit that provides similar opportunities for each candidate and follows interview procedures which treats all applicants consistently
  - Work to ensure an applicant pool that is diverse
Hiring Official Role

- Provides charge at first search committee meeting that includes:
  - Introduction of Diversity Advocate
  - Vision for position
  - Position description overview
  - Recruitment suggestions
  - Criteria for selection
  - Time frame
  - Finalist information
  - Documentation
Search Committee Chair Role

- The committee chair is responsible for the overall conduct of the search.
  - Organizing the Committee
  - Serve as liaison between committee and Hiring Official
  - Recruiting, Advertising and Networking
  - Communicating with Applicants
  - Evaluation Criteria/Selection of Finalists
  - Preparing for the Interviews
  - Conducting Interviews
  - Checking References
  - Completing the Search
Search Committee Member Role

• Search committees serve in an advisory capacity for the identification and selection of candidates, since the ultimate responsibility for hiring rests with the hiring official.

• The search committee member performs a variety of tasks under the direction of the search chair.

• Review the Search Committee Member Checklist - https://oae.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html
Search Coordinator (Job Contact) Role

- Initiate and process forms
- Coordinate and schedule committee meetings
- Assist applicants during the submission process
- Coordinate candidate interview arrangements and schedule
- Process HR transactions
- Complete search documentation and close the search
Confidentiality

• Confidentiality is critical.
• Maintain confidentiality of all candidate information and deliberations before, during and after the search.
• The University strives to not only avoid conflicts of interest and breaches of confidentiality, but also to avoid the appearance of a conflict.
• Confidentiality forms can be found at: https://oae.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html.
Types of Confidential Information

- Some examples of confidential information includes:
  - Identifying applicant information
  - Applicant documents (resume, CV, cover letter, etc.)
  - Candidate references and letters of references
  - Deliberation documents (interview questions, evaluation forms, committee member notes, etc.)
Who might “need to know”

• Support Staff (scheduling interviews, travel arrangements, etc.)

• Stakeholder Groups (other parties involved in interviewing applicants)

• Hiring Official (has access to the same information as committee members)
Consequences of Confidentiality Breaches

• Negative repercussions for candidates whose current employer is not aware that they are entertaining job offers.
  • Well qualified candidates may be reluctant to apply for fear that we cannot keep their information confidential.

• Strained relationships for current staff.
  • Internal candidates are often concerned with the confidentiality of the search process.

• Investigations from University Ethics and Office for Access and Equity
Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)

• Public Affairs handles most FOIA requests, documents may be requested and provided directly from the unit or from OAE.

• University Counsel can provide guidance on FOIA.
Conflicts of Interest

• Confidentiality and conflicts of interest often go hand-in-hand.

• Confidentiality breaches can lead to conflicts and perceived conflicts.

• Many complaints our office receives start as confidentiality breaches, but the allegations are most often of conflicts of interest or discrimination of some type.
Examples of Potential Conflicts

• Committee member has an undisclosed current or past relationship with an applicant
  • Relative, spouse, friend, advisee in applicant pool
  • Potential steps to be taken:
    • Notify chair of issue immediately
    • Chair may consult with HR staff, OAE

• Potential Remedies:
  • Recusal of committee member
  • Committee member abstains from evaluation of the specific candidate and does not take part in hiring decision of the candidate
  • Others depending on specifics of situation – consult OAE
Examples of Potential Conflicts

• Unsolicited information provided to committee regarding a candidate
  • Steps to be taken:
    • Notify chair of issue immediately
    • Chair may speak with HR staff, consult with OAE

• In general, unsolicited information should not be used unless it is pertinent and verifiable

• Information not pertinent to the duties, qualifications, or job requirements should never be included in the deliberation of the committee or the hiring official’s decision

• Sharing unsolicited information is strongly discouraged
Examples of Potential Conflicts

• Current colleague of committee member, hiring official in the applicant pool
  • This is not a conflict by itself, but can become one if not handled carefully
    • Current employees must be treated as any other applicant
    • Confidentiality rules apply – may need to take extra steps to ensure that current employees who are applicants do not have access to privileged information
    • Current employees who are applicants, even if they are no longer in consideration (screened or deemed not-hirable) must never participate in the review or evaluation process of other candidates
Perceived Conflicts Result in Complaints

• Complaints can turn into:
  • Unofficial investigations
  • Official internal investigations
    • Interviewing all committee members
    • Collecting additional information
  • Inquiries from University Ethics
  • Investigations from external agencies
For a Successfully Inclusive Search Developing the Position Description

• Where appropriate, label qualifications preferred instead of required; use should instead of must.

• Whenever possible, be flexible with arbitrary numeric measures, such as years of experience.

• Use phrases such as:
  • Experience with a variety of teaching methods and/or curricular perspectives
  • Academic experiences and interests in culturally diverse groups
  • Demonstrated success in working with diverse populations of students
  • Interest in developing/implementing curricula that address multicultural issues
For a Successfully Inclusive Search
Forming the Search Committee

• The composition of the search committee is critical to its success.
  • The search committee should be diverse.
  • Include individuals who have broad perspectives and a commitment to diversity.
  • Involve respected and highly visible committee members.
  • Sometimes assistant professors feel uncomfortable challenging associate and full professors.
First Search Committee Meeting

- Charge from Hiring Official
  - Expectations of the search committee
  - Defining the position and qualifications

- Diversity Advocate
  - Affirmative Action Placement Goal Discussion
  - Recruiting Strategies
  - Guarding Against Unconscious Bias

- Search Committee Chair
  - Evaluation Criteria for Screening Applicants
  - Decision Making for Interviews
  - Confidentiality
  - Conflicts of Interest
Strategies for Enhancing the Likelihood of a Successful Search

- Committees must do more than simply issue a position announcement and wait to receive C.V.s
  - Talk with colleagues at other institutions who might nominate potential candidates
  - Encourage colleagues who will be attending professional conferences to recruit for the position
  - Invite an individual on campus for a lecturer series
  - Email position announcements to graduate departments, professional journals, web recruitment boards, and newsgroups
  - Send announcements and request nominations in Historically Black Colleges and Universities, Hispanic, American Indian, and Asian serving institutions
Strategies to Increase the Diversity of the Pool

• Engage local and regional networks of people in related fields to see if they know of potential candidates.

• Contact women and minorities who have received significant grants or professional recognition and ask for the names of promising women and minority scholars.
Strategies to Increase the Diversity of the Pool

• Survey departments at other institutions to see which of them have strong records in awarding PhDs to underrepresented individuals and contact them for names.

• Maintain close contact with graduates of the U of I and encourage them to apply or to contact their students/colleagues.

• Ask members of the department to call colleagues at other institutions to see if they know of underrepresented individuals who might be qualified for and interested in the position.
Strategies to Increase the Diversity of the Pool

• Review databases for listings of diverse scholars and contact any that might fit the position description (see section 3.4 of Guidelines and Procedures for Academic Appointments)
  • Diversifying Higher Education Faculty in Illinois (DFI) Program Directory
  • Big Ten Academic Alliance Doctoral Directory
  • Southern Regional Education Board (SREB) (enter email address, diversity@illinois.edu and password SUB0114)

• Work with HR staff to mail/email job postings to graduate departments, professional journals/associations, web recruitment boards, electronic newsletters, newsgroups that represent diversity, Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs) and Hispanic, American Indian, and Asian serving institutions
Diversity of the Applicant Pool Report

### Diversity of the Pool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Port ID Number:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job Org Code:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEO Number:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auto-Generated Code:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Job Title: |
| Department: |
| Job Closing Date: 2/1/2016 |
| Data Refresh Date: 3/23/2016 |

### Summary by Race (does not include Hispanic or Latino)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 21 Female, 7 Male, 1 Unknown, 29 Total

### Summary by Veteran Status

If I am not a protected veteran or I choose not to disclose my protected veteran status.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 22 Female, 8 Male, 1 Unknown, 31 Total

### Summary by Disability Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I do not wish to answer</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, I do not have a disability</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I have a disability</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total: 22 Female, 8 Male, 1 Unknown, 31 Total
## Diversity of the Finalist Pool Report

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Applican pool</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Minority</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protected Veterans</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals with Disability</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Finalist pool</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Minority</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protected Veterans</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals with Disability</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Strategies to Avoid Bias

- Ensure consistent evaluation of all applicants by spending sufficient time reviewing each applicant.
- Evaluate each candidate’s entire application:
  - Avoid depending too heavily on only one element such as letters of recommendation, or the prestige of the degree-granting institution or post-doctoral program.
  - Be able to defend every decision for eliminating or advancing a candidate through documentation of decisions.
- Ensure careful/fair treatment of all applicants at each stage of the selection process (review, interviews, discussion of finalists).
Strategies to Avoid Bias

- Question your judgments and decisions and consider whether unintentional bias may have played a role
  - Are women or minority applicants subject to higher expectations in areas such as number/quality of publications? Name recognition? Personal acquaintance with well-known colleagues?
  - Are applicants who received degrees from institutions other than major research universities being considered? If not, why not?
  - Are achievements/contributions attributed to collaborators despite evidence to the contrary in publications and letters?
Interviews

• Schedule phone or on-campus interviews
• Develop a set of core questions to be asked of each candidate.
• Be sure all interviewers are aware of what questions are inappropriate (https://oae.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html)
• Consider who will interview the candidates
• Determine the interview structure and schedule
Interview Procedures

- Carefully prepare interview questions
- Hiring unit has discretion to determine if and/or how search committee participates in the interview process.
- Finalists should be asked similar questions and treated similarly.
- Justification for hire must be based on qualifications, experience, references, and interview.
Interviews

- Share Useful Information for Candidates
  - Employee Benefits
  - Cultural Events and Resources
  - Child Care
  - Schools
  - Spousal/Partner Hiring and Benefits
Evaluating the Interviewed Candidates

• Meet with search committee as soon as possible after interviews
• Discuss recommendations with Hiring Official
• Check references when Hiring Official asks to do so
• Communicate with candidates
• Decide how to proceed if top candidate declines
Verbal/Written Offers and Hire Date

• Summary Form
  • EEO Officer Approval
    • Verbal/Written Offer
  • Office for Access and Equity Approval
    • Before Hire Date

• Background Check Request Form
  • Submitted for all hires, Illinois HR will determine if check is required
  • Submit after acceptance and before hire date
Reports

• Academic Professional Affirmative Action Executive Summary Report
• Civil Service Affirmative Action Executive Summary Report
• Faculty Report

https://oae.illinois.edu/reports.html
What Stages Can Make a Difference?

All

- Pre-Posting Recruitment at conferences and networking
- Position Description Development
- Position Posting
- Evaluation of CVs
- Critical Review for Gender/Race Bias
- Interview of finalists/Use of TOP
- Offer/Negotiation/Dual Career
- Transition support
- Retention
Successful Search Strategies

• Specific college/department level employee targeted with recruitment support.
• Don’t limit your applicant pool by making your minimum requirements too narrow.
• Attend conferences to recruit and network with potential applicants.
• Be aware of the Dual Career Program - [https://humanresources.illinois.edu/dual-career-program/index.html](https://humanresources.illinois.edu/dual-career-program/index.html)
• Give your diversity advocate the authority to make sure the search process is fair.
Contact Information

Office for Access and Equity (OAE)
Phone: 217.333.0885
Fax: 217.244.9136
Email: accessandequity@Illinois.edu
Website: oae@Illinois.edu