Being a Change Agent in the Search Process

Diversity Advocate Training

Office for Access and Equity
Objectives

• Understand why diversity matters
• Discuss the role of bias in evaluation of applicants
• Learn how to be a change agent in the search process
• Become familiar with tools for increasing diversity of the applicant pool
• Discover techniques to reduce bias
Academic Search Process is integral to Illinois’ commitment to:

- Equal Employment Opportunity
- Affirmative Action
- Diversity
Campus Commitment to Diversity

University of Illinois System - Guiding Values include “Be inclusive, treat each other with dignity and respect, and promote citizenship” (https://www.uillinois.edu/about/mission/)

The faculty senate has affirmed the importance of diversity as central to the university’s goals (https://www.senate.illinois.edu/eq1002.asp)

Commitment to diversity can be seen across academic and campus life programs for students - Housing multicultural advocates, Office of Minority Student Affairs, Diversity and Social Justice programs, African American, Asian American Cultural Centers, La Casa Cultural Latina, LGBT resource center, Native American House, and many others.
Why does diversity matter?
Benefits Our Mission

Diversity benefits our teaching and research mission

- Diverse working groups more productive, creative, and innovative (e.g., Herring, 2009)
- Ideas generated by diverse groups of higher quality (McLeod et al., 1996)
- Level of critical analysis of decisions and alternatives higher in groups exposed to minority viewpoints (e.g., Sommers, 2006)
Diverse Groups are More Productive

- From 2006 to August 2014 companies with 1 or more women on the board of directors have outperformed companies without women on the board by:
  - 18% in Europe
  - 20% in the US
  - 55% in Asia

“...June [2014, was] the last school year ever in which a majority of America’s K-12 public-school students [were] white.”

“Americans are more racially and ethnically diverse than in the past, and the U.S. is projected to be even more diverse in the coming decades.”

“...as our society diversifies, broadening the circle of opportunity has become a matter of not only equity but also of competitiveness.”
What is bias & how can it affect application evaluation?
Bias

• A particular tendency, trend, inclination, feeling, or opinion, especially one that is preconceived or unreasoned
  • Everyone has biases
  • Can be both positive & negative
  • Quick decision, default mode of thinking

Unconscious Bias

• Bias we are unaware of and is outside of our control

• The ability to quickly categorize is a fundamental quality of the human mind and **happens to everyone**

• It occurs automatically and is triggered by our minds making quick assessments of people and situations

http://diversity.arizona.edu/sites/diversity/files/hidden_unconscious_bias_a_primer.pdf
Even if we have strong egalitarian values and believe we are not biased we may still behave in discriminatory ways (e.g., Dovidio, 2001).

Judgments shaped by a lifetime of experience and cultural history despite efforts to be objective about quality of work, etc., leading to unconscious bias (implicit stereotyping).

Applies to a variety of physical and social characteristics associated with race, gender, age, ethnicity—even height.
Unconscious Bias

• When shown photographs of people of the same height, evaluators overestimated men’s heights and underestimated women’s heights, even though a reference point, such as a doorway, was provided (Manis, Biernat, & Nelson, 1991)

• Decisions were based on assumptions about average height of men vs women despite evidence that the individual in question did not fit the stereotype

https://builtin.com/diversity-inclusion/unconscious-bias-examples
Unconscious Bias

• Resumes of applicants with “white-sounding” and “male” names were more likely to be interviewed for open positions than were equally qualified applicants with “African-American-sounding” or “female” names (Bertrand & Mullainathan, 2004; Steinpreis, Anders & Ritzke, 1999)

• When rating the quality of verbal skills as indicated by vocabulary definitions, evaluators rated skills lower if told that an African American provided the definitions than if a White person provided them (Biernat & Manis, 1994)
How can you be a change agent in the search process?
Search Committee Member Role

• Serve in an advisory capacity for the identification and selection of candidates; the ultimate responsibility for hiring rests with the hiring official

• Work with the search chair to ensure committee tasks are completed
  • Entire committee should be an advocate for diversity
  • Recruit, advertise and network
  • Evaluate applications and conduct interviews
Search Committee Member Role

• All committee members should be familiar with the Academic Search Process website
  • Review the Search Process Overview presentation
  • Also see key role guidelines, compliance resources, etc.
  • http://diversity.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html
Confidentiality

- Confidentiality is critical
- Maintain confidentiality of all candidate information and deliberations before, during, and after search
- Extra caution with internal candidates
  - Even if no longer under consideration, cannot be involved in any aspect of search
  - Consider making calendar invites private
Affirmative Action Placement Goals & Hiring Benchmark

• Goals are set when the percentage of minorities or women currently employed in a particular job group is less than reasonably expected given their percentage of availability in the workforce

• There is a workforce utilization goal for individuals with disabilities and a hiring benchmark for protected veterans, for all job groups
Affirmative Action Placement Goals & Hiring Benchmark

Goals are target rates of hire
Goals are not hiring quotas
Used to guide our Good Faith Efforts
Always hire best qualified candidate

The expectation:
In the absence of bias occurring, over time, the gender, racial and ethnic profiles, as well as the veteran and disability status of our employees, will mirror the population from which we recruit.
Document Good Faith Efforts

• Efforts to broaden the pool of qualified candidates to include minorities, women, individuals with disabilities and protected veterans

• Document Everything
  • When outreach happened
  • Who was contacted
  • Which group was targeted
  • What outreach occurred

• Monitor effectiveness of outreach/recruitment strategies in attracting applicants

https://www.berkshireassociates.com/balanceview/five-tips-for-effectively-tracking-outreach-efforts
What are some ways to increase the diversity of the pool?
Strategies to Increase Diversity of the Pool

• Work with HR staff to email job postings to professional journals/associations, web recruitment boards or electronic newsletters for diverse applicants in a particular field, Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs) and Hispanic, American Indian, and Asian serving institutions

• Engage local and regional networks of people in related fields to see if they know of potential candidates
Strategies to Increase Diversity of the Pool

• Encourage colleagues who will be attending professional conferences to recruit for the position

• Ask members of the department to call colleagues at other institutions to see if they know of underrepresented individuals who might be qualified for and interested in the position
Continued Recruitment

• Always be recruiting
• More successful when on-going
• The best candidates often do not check job boards
Diversity of the Applicant Pool & EEO Source

• The Office for Access and Equity (OAE) will automatically provide a report after the search has closed (i.e. removed from the job board)

• If the pool is insufficient the search may be extended

• Diversity of the applicant pool can be tracked at any time by contacting OAE
### Diversity of the Pool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Post ID Number:</th>
<th>123456</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job Org Code:</td>
<td>1736000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auto Generated Code:</td>
<td>A20005600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Title:</td>
<td>Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department:</td>
<td>Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Closing Date:</td>
<td>5/12/2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Summary by Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic or Latina/o</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Hispanic or Latina/o</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>67</strong></td>
<td><strong>28</strong></td>
<td><strong>0</strong></td>
<td><strong>85</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Summary by Race (does not include Hispanic or Latina/o)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>American Indian or Alaska Native</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or More Races</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>50</strong></td>
<td><strong>27</strong></td>
<td><strong>0</strong></td>
<td><strong>77</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Diversity of the Pool & EEO Source Report

## Summary by Veteran Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Veteran Status</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am not a protected veteran or I choose not to disclose my protected veteran status.</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I identify as one or more of the categories of protected veterans listed above.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>57</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Summary by Disability Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Disability Status</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I do not wish to answer</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Answer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, I do not have a disability</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I have a disability</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>67</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## EEO Source

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Source</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higher Ed Jobs</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>34.78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indeed.com</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>16.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LinkedIn</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>1.09%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Reference</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>2.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Illinois Website</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>45.65%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Diversity of the Finalist Pool Report

For the Sample Position search, applicant and finalist pool demographics are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applicant pool:</th>
<th>Finalist pool:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>Minority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82%</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Minority</td>
<td>Non Minority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
<td>Did Not Answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protected Veterans</td>
<td>Protected Veterans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals with Disability</td>
<td>Individuals with Disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the information above, there is an opportunity to meet an affirmative action placement goal with this finalist pool. There is also a 7% workforce utilization goal for individuals with disabilities and a 5.7% hiring benchmark for protected veterans.

Only sent if there are three or more finalists selected.
What are some ways to reduce bias?
Strategies to Avoid Bias

• Spend **sufficient time** reviewing each person

• Ensure consistent and fair treatment of all applicants at **every stage** of the selection process
  • Application review
  • Screening & finalist interviews
  • Discussion of finalists

• Consider including a diversity interview question
Strategies to Avoid Bias

• Evaluate each candidate’s entire application
  • Avoid depending too heavily on only one element such as letters of recommendation
  • Before reviewing anyone, be very clear and in agreement about what is required/preferred for each job and what that looks like
  • Be able to defend every decision for eliminating or advancing a candidate by documenting process
Strategies to Avoid Bias

• Question your judgments and decisions & consider whether unintentional bias may have played a role

• Question if all the final candidates are similar

• Discuss, monitor, and point out biases if they emerge in the search process
Typical Actions of a Diversity Advocate

• Initiate a conversation about diversity at first committee meeting

• Encourage hiring manager and search committee members to network with outside organizations to attract diverse candidates

• Work with committee to ensure and track diversity of the pool
Typical Actions of a Diversity Advocate

• Ensure candidates are evaluated fairly and consistently using established criteria.

• Ensure that the rationale to remove a candidate from consideration is valid and free of bias.

• Provide similar opportunities for each candidate and follow interview procedures which treat all applicants consistently.
Contact Information

Office for Access and Equity (OAE)

• Phone: 217.333.0885
• Email: accessandequity@illinois.edu
• Website: http://oae.illinois.edu